
June 30, 2024 Auditor General Work Plan Status

Report

06.30.2024

—



Office of the Municipal Auditor General,
The Corporation of the City of Windsor

Executive Summary

November 25, 2023 to June 30, 2024

2023 Workplan Overview

Overall, the projects included in the 2023 Auditor General work plan are more than 75% complete and are expected to meet the final reporting timeline of December 2024/January 2025. Within that timeline boundary, two projects have been completed, two have been delayed (within the overall timeline), and the final one is on plan:

- “Procurement - Education Compliance” was completed as planned
- The additional project, “CCEP Hotline Revisions, Updates, Enhancement and Digital Enablement,” was completed during this reporting period.
- The initial BIA project is about 1-1.5 months behind the work plan timeline due to developing and validating the BIA compliance work program to be used across all BIAs and developing templates.
- The second BIA project was postponed as negotiations with an external accounting firm were being explored so that they could conduct 8 of the 9 BIA reviews in a condensed timeframe. Unfortunately, these negotiations fell through. As a result, the project has been rescheduled to commence in July to enable final timeline reporting. Additional talent has been added to the Risk Savvy team instead of engaging a consulting firm.

2024 Workplan Overview

Overall, the projects included as part of the 2024 Auditor General work plan are more than 30% complete, with four projects completed:

- Management Action Plan Validation
- Concerned Citizen/Employee Hotline Administration and Oversight
- AG management functions and status reporting
- Revisions to AG Workplan - Interim Risk Assessment Refresh

In addition, the gap assessment and action plan related to *JIA International Professional Practices Revisions Roadmap and Alignment with Municipal Act (Auditor General Elements) Initial Gap Assessment & Resolution Plan* project has been completed.

All other 2024 work plan projects remain on the planned timeline

Concerned Citizen Complaint Investigation Status

Overall, an increase in allegations has been noted since early winter 2023. There is an ongoing increase in:

- inbound communications requiring follow-up to understand the actual complaint/allegation
- the number of potential allegations requiring consideration/investigation
- complexity/nature of the inbound allegations (treatment, fairness, applicable entities, etc.)
- volume of content submitted for consideration
- Count of spam and wrong number/hangups

The proposed revisions to the Concerned Citizen/Employee Hotline Administration and Oversight protocol will help address some of these impacts in the future.

During the period, the following investigations were:

- Completed: Inappropriate Language and Racial Comments and Noise Concerns at Public Facilities
- Commenced: Supported Care Home Treatment Concerns, Inappropriate Disbursement of Funds, Treatment of Citizen and Property Lein Issue

In the Coming Period (before Dec. 31/24)

The following projects are expected to be commenced and completed in the coming period:

- Ford City BIA compliance review
- 2nd BIA compliance review
- 3rd BIA compliance review
- IIA International Professional Practices Revisions Roadmap and Alignment with Municipal Act (Auditor General Elements)
- The final component of the 2024 Concerned Citizen/Employee Hotline Administration and Oversight,
- The final period of the Auditor General management functions and status reporting for 2024
- Any required revisions to the 2024 AG Workplan - Interim Risk Assessments
- Complaint investigations will continue and be woven into the gaps in the project timelines.

Contents

Executive Summary	i
Work Plan Progress	1
2023 Work Plan Progress	1
2024 Work Plan Progress	2
Concerned Citizen Complaint Investigation Status	3
Appendices	
Appendix A - Reports issued in the period	4
Procurement - Education Compliance	4
Procurement Education Awareness Overview	4
Management Action Plan Validation	6
CCEP Hotline Revisions, Updates, Enhancement and Digital Enablement	7
Inappropriate Language and Racial Comments	10
Noise Concerns at Public Facilities	12
IIA International Professional Practices Revisions Roadmap and Alignment with Municipal Act (Auditor General Elements) Initial Gap Assessment & Resolution Plan	13
Appendix B - Complaints & Investigation	15

Work Plan Progress

2023 Work Plan Progress

(Previous Forecasted Final reporting to Council - Nov/December 2024)

Planned Project	Progress	Report Issued
Procurement – Education compliance		✓
Partial scope of 9 BIAs over 3 years		○ ○ ○
Management action plan validation		✓
CCEP Hotline Revisions, UpdateS, Enhancement and Digital Enablement		✓
Concerned citizen and employee hotline		✓ ✓
Risk assessment refresh		✓
Oversight, administration and reporting		✓ ✓
AG Functions		NA
Unallocated		✓
Overall Plan Progress		NA

Legend:

To be issued ○ Issued/Completed ✓ Cancelled X

Notes:

- Completed in the period:
 - Procurement - Education Compliance
 - CCEP Hotline Revisions, Updates, Enhancement and Digital Enablement
- Of the remaining projects, all three are BIA-related:
 - 1 is in the validation of findings and will move to reporting to the BIA shortly with reporting to City Council after the presentation to the BIA Board
 - 1 is in the planning stages
 - 1 will commence planning in July
 - The final 3 reports are expected to be delivered to Council on or before the Dec 24/Jan 25 timeline (contingent on prior BIA Board presentation alignments)

2024 Work Plan Progress

(Previous Forecasted Final reporting to Council - June 2025)

Planned Project	Progress	Report Issued
Partial scope of 9 BIAs over 3 years		○○○
Management action plan validation		✓
IIA International Professional Practices Revisions Roadmap and Alignment with Municipal Act (Auditor General Elements)		✓○
Concerned citizen and employee hotline		✓○
Risk assessment refresh		○
Oversight, administration and reporting		✓○
AG Functions		NA
Unallocated		NA
Overall Plan Progress		NA

Legend:

To be issued ○ Issued/Completed ✓ Cancelled X

Notes:

- Completed in the period:
 - Management Action Plan Validation
 - Concerned Citizen/Employee Hotline Administration and Oversight
 - AG management functions and status reporting
 - Update to AG Workplan - Interim Risk Assessment Refresh
- Phase two of The IIA International Professional Practices Revisions Roadmap and Alignment with Municipal Act (Auditor General Elements) project will commence in July/August.

Concerned Citizen Complaint Investigation Status

Planned Project	Report Issued
Inappropriate Language And Racial Comments	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Noise Concerns at Public Facilities	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Supported Care Home Treatment Concerns	<input type="checkbox"/>
Inappropriate Disbursement of Funds	<input type="checkbox"/>
Treatment of Citizen	<input type="checkbox"/>
Building Inspections	<input type="checkbox"/>
Inappropriate Service and Treatment Regarding Social Support	<input type="checkbox"/>
Hiring Practices	<input type="checkbox"/>
Property Lein Issues	<input type="checkbox"/>
Investment Practices	<input type="checkbox"/>

Legend:

To be issued Issued/Completed Cancelled

Notes:

- Completed in the period:
 - Inappropriate Language and Racial Comments Investigation and Report
 - Investigation and Report on Noise Concerns at Public Facilities
 - External and Internal Legal Consultation on the Municipal Act Auditor General Role and investigations into areas outside City departments

Appendix A - Reports issued in the period

An extract of the report's executive summary is included below, and the full report is attached in the appendix to this status report.

Procurement - Education Compliance

Procurement Education Awareness Overview

Procurement training and awareness is a preventative control measure designed to inform and educate City personnel with the authority to make purchases on behalf of the City about the expected practices and methods.

Such training is currently a requirement in the Bylaw for all personnel with purchasing authority.

Insights

- Formal training is provided through the City of Windsor management certificate program and is available to other enrollees.
- The Procurement team offers and delivers informal training to meet specific needs.
- On-the-job training also occurs as someone transitions into a role.

Project Purpose

Education of individuals with purchasing authority who must comply with the By-law is a significant awareness and preventative control mechanism. Equipping these individuals regarding the proper use and interpretation of the Purchasing By-law helps reduce the risk of non-compliance.

This audit considered the process and controls management had in place to achieve the following objectives:

1. Required By-Law elements are included in expected training materials/content.
2. There is a method to equip individuals with purchasing authority regarding the proper use and interpretation of the Purchasing By-law that helps reduce the risk of non-compliance.
3. There is a method to sustain awareness, inform previously trained personnel about new updates, and reinforce existing purchasing practices.
4. There is a mechanism by which management knows that individuals exercising purchasing authority in the period have met the minimum training requirements.

What We Did

Below is a sample selection of some of our activities:

- We reviewed training material to determine if it aligned with the procurement bylaw and internal processes.

What We Did (continued)

- We considered the means, methods and facilitators of delivering the training.
- We reviewed the design of the various controls, which are pushed out to department heads to ensure that individuals needing the training are (1) identified and (2) that such training occurs.
- We selected a random sample of personnel deemed to have the authority to purchase and determined if they were listed as having attended training or not per the HR records.
- We acquired a listing of personnel who have Purchase Cards and evaluated (1) whether all individuals with individual transaction limits greater than \$15,000 were listed on the HR training completion list or not and (2) a random sample of individuals with authority to purchase under \$15,000 were listed on the HR training completion list or not

What We Found

We noted several key controls were in place and operating effectively; however, we also noted instances of non-compliance and missing evidence. Such exceptions are likely due to the breadth and depth of Procurement bylaw applicability. The bylaw requires all individuals with the authority to purchase to attend Procurement Bylaw training. This breadth and specificity may result in broader requirements than intended or required.

Some Improvement Opportunities

<p>Management Comments</p>	<p>In summary, the audit identified areas for enhancement, particularly in updating and refining the purchasing bylaw and training materials; overall, management shall take proactive steps by developing action plans to update the purchasing bylaw, enhance training materials, and implement periodic training refreshers. Management will continue to demonstrate a commitment to improving internal controls and ensuring compliance with purchasing practices. Additionally, management's dedication to continuous improvement will consider improving the relationship between the purchasing bylaw and the purchase card policy. Management will mitigate single points of training dependency through the execution of management action plans. These efforts collectively position the City to improve operational effectiveness and minimize the risk of non-compliance in procurement activities.</p>
<p>Name:</p>	<p>Dana Paladino</p>
<p>Title:</p>	<p>Commissioner of Corporate Services (A)</p>
<p>Date:</p>	<p>March 11, 2023</p>

Management Action Plan Validation

Management is showing substantial progress on most open action plans. This year, the total open action plans were the lowest in eleven (11) years. Management has made significant progress in addressing open findings.

The year 2023 began with six (6) action plans carried forward, all addressed in some manner.

Of the findings closed in the period:

- one (1) was closed in advance,
- four (4) were resolved in the period,
- one (1) was risk accepted.

Rating

Four (4) [100%] of the management action plans intended for closure in the period were completed, resulting in an overall conclusion of one hundred percent (100%)—"Well Controlled."

Closed as planned and closed in advance: In the period, six (6) items were closed versus an expected four (4), a total closure rate of one hundred percent (100%):

- Four (4) management action plans were closed as planned in the period
- One (1) management action plan was closed ahead of schedule
- One (1) management action plan was closed via formal risk acceptance

Scope Period

January 1, 2023, through December 31, 2023

Approach

For validating the management action plan, the activities undertaken by internal audit included:

- Requesting status updates and contact information from management;
- Testing/validating evidence of management's resolution/disposition of the original finding for items expected to be closed or indicated as completed by management;
- Preparing a report on the outcomes of the management action plan internal audit activity.

CCEP Hotline Revisions, Updates, Enhancement and Digital Enablement

Overall, an increase in allegations has been noted since early winter 2023. There is an ongoing increase in:

- inbound communications requiring follow-up to understand the actual complaint/allegation
- the number of potential allegations requiring consideration/investigation
- complexity/nature of the inbound allegations (treatment, fairness, applicable entities, etc.)
- volume of content submitted for consideration
- Count of spam and wrong number/hangups

The proposed revisions to the Concerned Citizen/Employee Hotline Administration and Oversight protocol will help address some of these impacts in the future.

The modifications in the proposed protocol may be summarized as follows:

- Added precision to selected elements such as timing and determination of protocol applicability, and adjusted wording on role consolidation.
- Reduced layers of review are no longer necessary.
- Aligned scope boundaries to other public municipal complaint procedures.
- Added consideration for workplace issues and citizen treatment escalation.
- Added sections on Anonymity, Confidentiality, Whistle Blower Protection (impacts section numbering)
- Updated escalation procedures and effort allocations for actual impacts noted in the last 2-3 years
- Reduced materiality considerations
- Revised complaint submission forms to enable digital capture option, support the collection of required minimum information and provide alternate collection methods

One item for Council determination is the scope of the Concerned Citizen/Employee Hotline Protocol. The scope could include:

Analysis	Option A	Option B
The CCEHP applies to:	Complaints may be filed regarding the City of Windsor: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • employees, • Management, and • contractors. 	Complaints may be filed regarding the City of Windsor: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • employees, • Management, and • contractors.
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Local Boards (with approved Opt-In Letters) • Municipally Controlled Corporations • Grant Recipients • The Committee of Adjustment • The Windsor Public Library • The Windsor Police Services Board (WPSB) • The Windsor Public Library Board (WPLB)

The CCEHP does not apply to:	The CCEHP process does not apply to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Mayor or City Councillors or their political office staff (please contact the Integrity Commissions for such concerns) • The Windsor Essex County Health Unit • The Essex Region Conservation Authority 	The CCEHP process does not apply to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Mayor or City Councillors or their political office staff (please contact the Integrity Commissions for such concerns) • The Windsor Essex County Health Unit • The Essex Region Conservation Authority
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Local Boards (with approved Opt-In Letters) • Municipally Controlled Corporations • Grant Recipients • The Committee of Adjustment • The Windsor Public Library • The Windsor Police Services Board (WPSB) • The Windsor Public Library Board (WPLB) 	

Below is a summary of the possible scope coverage options for the CCEHP:

Analysis	Option A	Option B
Pros:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reduced total effort allocation • Reduced impact on the overall work plan • Some entities have an established complaint process • Aligns to the structure of some other published municipalities with an Auditor General 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increased scope/coverage • Centralization of complaint management • Established complaint management process
Cons:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reduced scope/coverage • Directing complaints to specific entities for consideration • Some entities do not have a complaint management process 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increased time/attention on allegation management and investigations • Potential reduction in annual overall work plan efforts on other projects

		<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Does not leverage existing complaint management processes at other entities.
--	--	--

Given that the Concerned Citizen/Employee Hotline is a City initiative administered by the Auditor General and in the independent Service Provider (Risk Savvy Ltd.), the Auditor General is seeking Council's directions as to the scope coverage:

- Option A or Option B

Inappropriate Language and Racial Comments

Background

An allegation was received indicating that the leader of a City Functional Area/Department had:

1. Accused the citizen of being illiterate and insulted the citizen.
2. Inferred that the citizen was racist by using a racial slur.

Further, the above elements may be tied to centuries-old prejudice between nationalities.

The individual indicated they had approached management and elected officials and had been directed to the Auditor General.

Investigation Approach

1. Review the email trail and make summary notes of the conversation.
2. Determine if the complaint is against the head of a City department.
3. Based on a review of the evidence provided by the citizen, identify if the City department head accused the citizen of being illiterate and insulted the citizen.
4. Based on a review of the evidence provided by the citizen, identify if the City department head inferred that the citizen was racist by using a racial slur.
5. Review what it means to make a racial slur to understand if the use of terms by the City Department head used a racial slur by suggesting one had been made as a result of "not understanding the vocabulary." *Note that the allegation indicates that a historical circumstance might exacerbate or contribute to the above.*

Scope Limitation

Email evidence was the only material reviewed. No verbal conversations between the parties was considered; however, the email correspondence supports the conclusion that no such discussions occurred.

Summary of Procedures and Findings

Since the exchange occurred over email, tone and context cannot be as readily identified.

The complainant sometimes used precise terminology/ phraseology, which is not necessarily commonly used in conversation. Some phrases were more British than standard Canadian terms. Several terms directed at City personnel were demeaning, and one is noted in several dictionaries as technically insulting or derogatory.

Management may wish to:

1. Create a channel by which personnel/citizens who feel they have been discriminated against, harassed, prejudiced, etc., can contact to raise their concerns for analysis/investigation.
2. Consider a process whereby when communication with individuals is limited/restricted in any way, a second management representative reviews the outgoing message before issuance.
3. Management should ensure that the options/methods are straightforward when enforcing one form of communication with a citizen or contact.

Management Comments

From a procedural standpoint, there are many avenues one may use to report a complaint. Most commonly, this is by calling 311, where it gets directed to the appropriate department head to address or the Policy and Procedures Coordinator.

Over and above the Hotline, the Corporation offers the following as it relates to channels for personnel/citizens who feel they may be discriminated against or may

	<p>otherwise have concerns, these channels include forms of communication that may be provided:</p> <p>Respectful Workplace Policy which specifies, amongst other items, that The Corporation of the City of Windsor (the “Corporation”) is dedicated to providing a workplace and service environment that is conducive to creating a climate of mutual respect that fosters equality and inclusion, reinforces opportunity and allows for each person to contribute fully to the development and well being of the Corporation.</p> <p>The Corporation maintains a zero-tolerance approach to workplace violence, harassment or discrimination whether between employees, involving an employee, an official (elected or appointed) or a customer of the Corporation in the exercise of workplace responsibilities. All reported incidents of workplace violence, harassment, and discrimination and incidents of workplace harassment that the Corporation becomes aware of, shall be reviewed and appropriate action shall be taken.</p> <p>It should be noted that this policy is on the City’s Website under City Hall and policies. Also this website indicates to call 311 or the Policy and Procedures</p> <p>Standards of Employee Department notes the Corporation will not tolerate employees engaging in acts or gestures of violence and harassment towards other employees or a member of the public in violation of the Corporate Workplace Violence Policy or any portion of the Respectful Workplace Program. Engaging in acts of discrimination towards other employees or a member of the public in violation of the Corporate Human Rights Policy, the Respectful Workplace Program or the Ontario Human Rights Code is not tolerated.</p> <p>Our Workplace Harassment Procedures provides a process wherein incidents resulting from alleged workplace harassment and/or sexual harassment are reviewed and addressed in accordance with the Occupational Health & Safety Act, Canada Labour Code Part 3, and corporate policy, and that appropriate corrective actions are identified and implemented to prevent reoccurrence.</p> <p>Additionally the purpose of the Employee and Volunteer Code of Ethics and Conflict of Interest Policy is to state the values and principles by which employees and volunteers are to govern their actions in the exercise of their duties.</p>
<p>Name:</p>	<p>Vincenza Mihalo</p>
<p>Title:</p>	<p>Executive Director of Human Resources</p>
<p>Date:</p>	<p>June 4, 2024</p>

Noise Concerns at Public Facilities

Background

An allegation was received indicating that the noise (music) at a City Facility was too loud, and complaints/concerns were not being addressed. Specifically:

1. Verbal and written complaints were provided to various personnel in the City.
2. A noise decibel report was prepared using the complainant's phone, and a concern was submitted, which was endorsed by other participants.
3. The complainant eventually indicated they had to move to another facility to handle the noise level.

Investigation Approach

1. Enquire whether management has received and considered noise complaints at the facility in question.
2. Consider the applicability of noise-related policies.
3. Consider the noise management practices management has in effect.

Scope Limitation

The scope and practices considered were focused on the specific site alleged by the complainant.

Summary of Procedures and Findings

Management was able to provide support to indicate that the complainant's concerns had been (1) heard, (2) considered, and (3) acted upon. However, given the timing of the complaint and the nature of management's evidence of control at that time, conclusive evidence could not reasonably be detected either way.

Management may wish to:

1. Formalize the basis and specific acceptable noise level for City locations (or times) where babies and infants are reasonably expected to attend.
2. A formal process/requirement for monitoring dBA when a noise complaint is implemented, communicated and executed. Such a process should ensure that the monitoring is conducted independently from the individual controlling the sound and should also include an element of future randomness/unexpectedness.
3. Site considerations/approaches to managing sound should also consider "spikes/variances" in sound levels so the limits are set with peaks and audiences/participants in mind. Some sound systems may adjust for this or factor this into audio projection.

Management Comments	Administration was aware of the situation and took appropriate action prior to the Auditor General raising and discussing the concern. Suggestions made by the Auditor General will be considered where appropriate as it relates to future public events.
Name:	Jen Knights
Title:	Executive Director Recreation and Culture
Date:	July 10, 2024

IIA International Professional Practices Revisions Roadmap and Alignment with Municipal Act (Auditor General Elements) Initial Gap Assessment & Resolution Plan

Context

On January 9, 2024, the Institute for Internal Auditors (IIA) Standards Board released the updated [Global Internal Audit Standards](#) (Standards), the main component of the [International Professional Practices Framework \(IPPF\)](#). The new guidance replaces the 2017 Standards and is effective January 9, 2025.

The Standards guide the worldwide professional practice of internal audit and serve as the basis for evaluating and elevating the quality of the internal audit function. The standards are mandatory for internal audit practitioners and for maintaining the Certified Internal Auditor accreditation.

Given the above context, the fact that personnel within the Office of the Auditor General hold the Certified Internal Auditor Accreditation and that the IIA IPPF is referenced in the current internal audit/Auditor General contract and Charter, there are two options:

1. the Office of the Auditor General will undertake a gap assessment and subsequent gap resolution process to conform by January 9, 2025, or
2. the in-force contracts will be amended, individual accreditations will be cancelled and the Auditor General Charter updated as appropriate..

Unless City Council directs otherwise, the Auditor General and the related Office will move forward with option 1 - the Office of the Auditor General will undertake a gap assessment and subsequent gap resolution process to conform by January 9, 2025

Overview of the New Standard & Changes

At the heart of the Standards are 15 principles comprised of five domains:

Domain I: Purpose of Internal Auditing
Domain II: Ethics and Professionalism
Domain III: Governing the Internal Audit Function
Domain IV: Managing the Internal Audit Function
Domain V: Performing Internal Audit Services

The new Standards differ from the 2017 guidance in several ways:

- *Emphasis on risk management alignment*
- *Formalized communication channels*
- *Expanded scope of activities*
- *Focus on technology and data analytics*
- *Structural changes*

Summary of Gap Assessment

The Auditor General directly conducted a gap assessment using:

1. Attendance at a workshop/seminar on what has changed in the IIA IPPF.
2. Leveraging the IIA-published [Conformance Readiness Tool](#) to identify new areas to address.
3. A review of the IIA-published [Complete Global Internal Audit Standards](#).

The [Conformance Readiness Tool](#) lists 27 new significant areas and reviews the [Complete Global Internal Audit Standards](#), identifying two other elements and several areas for enhancement.

In several instances, the requirements are practices currently informally in place that need to be codified and have evidence routinely generated as a natural output to demonstrate sustained compliance with the professional standards. In other areas, the requirements and evidentiary elements are new.

Resolution Plan

Fifteen specific initiatives/workstreams have been identified to enable the Office of the Auditor General to be ready to comply by January 9, 2025

Appendix B - Complaints & Investigation

Year	Checked within timeframe	Inbound	Hangups/Spam	Routed to Management	Other	Under Analysis	Under Investigation	Investigated
2023	Yes	252	219	25	5	2	1	0
2024	Yes	220	195	10	8	4	1	2