

KK/
Windsor, Ontario November 9, 2011

A meeting of the **Windsor Heritage Committee** is held this day commencing at 5:30 o'clock p.m. in Room 402, 400 City Hall Square East, there being present the following members:

Robin Easterbrook, Chair
Councillor Al Maghnieh
Lynn Raeburn Baker
Andrew Foot
Jeffrey Mellow
Noreen Slack

Regrets received from:

Simon Chamely

Delegations include the following:

Mr. Yingtao Shi, regarding Item 5.1

Also present are the following resource personnel:

John R. Calhoun, Heritage Planner
Cathy Masterson, Manager of Cultural Affairs
Karen Kadour, Committee Coordinator (A)

1. CALL TO ORDER

The Chair calls the meeting to order at 5:30 o'clock p.m. and the Committee considers the Agenda being Schedule "A" **attached** hereto, matters which are dealt with as follows:

2. ADOPTION OF THE MINUTES

Moved by L. Baker, seconded by J. Mellow,
That the minutes of the Windsor Heritage Committee at its meeting held September 14, 2011 **BE ADOPTED** as presented.
Carried.

3. **DECLARATIONS OF CONFLICT**

None.

5. **BUSINESS ITEMS**

5.1 **Perry-Breault House, 245 Mill Street**

Mr. Yingtao Shi, property owner is present and available to answer questions.

J. Calhoun advises that Mr. Shi has requested the following modifications to the property:

- I. Solar panels are to be added to the rear roof, facing south-southwest.
2. The rear chimney will be lowered in height to about 1 m (3.3 ft) from the bottom edge of the roof and will be taken out of service.
3. Three skylights will be added. None of the skylights will be visible from Mill Street.

Moved by Councillor Maghnieh, seconded by J. Mellow,
That the proposed modification of the property at 245 Mill Street (Plan 40 Part Lot 5), identified as the Perry-Breault House, **BE APPROVED** as submitted, under provisions of the *Ontario Heritage Act, Part IV*.

Carried.

5.2 **St. Bernard School, 1847 Meldrum Road**

A memo from the Heritage Planner dated November 3, 2011 entitled "St. Bernard School, 1847 Meldrum Road" is distributed and ***attached*** as Appendix "A".

J. Calhoun states on September 23, 2011, members of the Windsor Heritage Committee, the Architectural Conservancy of Ontario, and the Heritage Planner met with Mario Iatonna, Superintendent of Business, Windsor-Essex Catholic District School Board (WECDSB). A tour of St. Bernard School was conducted on October 4, 2011 with Fred Alexander, School Board Trustee.

J. Calhoun indicates that on October 29, 2011, the Windsor Star reported that the WECDSB had voted to close St. Bernard and another school, and combine the student body at a new school to be constructed on City park property adjacent to St. Bernard. The article did not mention the proposed fate of the existing building.

L. Baker expresses concern relating to the loss of the facade.

The Chair suggests that the WHC work with the School Board to undertake a study of the integrity of the structure. A. Foot recommends contacting Norm Becker, The Becker Engineering Group Inc. to determine his fee to conduct the study.

The Chair states that a "properly rehabilitated" school is every bit as good as a new school and will last longer.

It is suggested that a presentation that outlines the merits of rehabilitation be undertaken and presented at the WECDSB meeting to be held after January 2012. J. Calhoun and the Chair will generate the presentation and the Committee will view it upon completion.

5.3 Community Heritage Ontario

Moved by A. Foot, seconded by L. Baker,
That **APPROVAL BE GIVEN** to an expenditure in the amount of \$75.00 for the annual membership to Community Heritage Ontario.
Carried.

5.4 Committee Operating Budget

J. Calhoun distributes the "Business Plan and Financial Request for 2012 Budget Deliberations", attached as Appendix "B".

Moved by N. Slack, seconded by L. Baker,
That the request for \$7,400 as outlined in the "Business Plan and Financial Request for 2012 Budget Deliberations" **BE INCREASED** by \$400 for a total of \$7,800.
Carried.

Moved by A. Foot, seconded by L. Baker,
That **APPROVAL BE GIVEN** to an expenditure in the upset amount of \$3,000 (in 2011) for the purchase of ten plaques to be presented to the owners of designated properties.
Carried.

6. COMMUNICATIONS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

6.3 Archaeological Site

The Ministry of Culture deems that all archaeologists who carry out fieldwork in Ontario are required by law to hold a ministry issued licence. In consultation with the Property Negotiator, City of Windsor, J. Calhoun advises that the "licence" allows the investigation of the site for a limited amount of time.

Councillor Maghnieh leaves the meeting at 6:25 o'clock p.m.

Moved by L. Baker, seconded by A. Foot,
That **APPROVAL BE GIVEN** to an expenditure of \$2,000 (in 2011) for the
Doors Open Windsor 2012 event.
Carried.

6.1 Heritage Week- February 20-26, 2012

L. Baker suggests that the "Colouring Contest" (picture of a designated property) for primary grade students be rekindled. J. Calhoun distributes a sample of a previous colouring contest (Mackenzie Hall), ***attached*** as Appendix "C".

It is generally agreed that the Capitol Theatre will be showcased in the 2012 Colouring Contest. The Committee Coordinator is to contact the former Heritage Planner to determine if her son (previous artist) is able to assist with the drawing.

Moved by A. Foot, seconded by L. Baker,
That **APPROVAL BE GIVEN** to an expenditure in the amount of \$200. for a
line drawing of the Capitol Theatre.
Carried.

6.2 ACO/CHO Conference. June 3-5, 2011, Cobourg, Ontario

No report.

6.4 Policy changes redefining Committee Role

No report.

7. DATE OF NEXT MEETING

The next meeting will be held on January 11, 2012 at 5:30 o'clock p.m. in Room 402, 400 City Hall Square East.

8. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting is adjourned at 7:02 o'clock p.m.

CHAIR

(A) COMMITTEE COORDINATOR

AGENDA
and Schedule "A"
to the minutes of the
Windsor Heritage Committee
meeting held
November 9, 2011
at 5:30 o'clock p.m.
in Room 402, 400 City Hall Square East

1. **CALL TO ORDER**

2. **ADOPTION OF THE MINUTES**

Adoption of the minutes of the meeting held September 14, 2011 (*previously distributed*)

3. **DECLARATIONS OF CONFLICT**

4. **DELEGATIONS**

Mr. Yingtao Shi, regarding *Item 5.1*

5. **BUSINESS ITEMS**

5.1 **Perry-Breault House, 245 Mill Street**

Consider recommendation on request to modify this heritage-designated property by adding solar panels, lowering a chimney, and adding skylights

5.2 **St. Bernard School, 1847 Meldrum Road**

Consider Committee action regarding the decision by the Windsor-Essex Catholic District School Board (WECDSB) to close the school, which is listed on the Windsor Municipal Heritage Register

5.3 **Community Heritage Ontario**

Consider request for \$75 from the Windsor Heritage Committee operating fund for annual committee membership

5.4 **Committee Operating Budget**

Consider budget request for the Windsor Heritage Committee's operating fund

6. **COMMUNICATIONS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS**

6.1 **Heritage Week- February 20-26, 2012**
Built Heritage Awards and other recognition

6.2 **ACO/CHO Conference, June 3-5, Cobourg, Ontario**
Report of Heritage Planner

6.3 **Archaeological Site**
Status of request

6.4 **Policy changes redefining Committee role**
Continued discussion considering staff approvals with and without Committee recommendations, fewer Council approvals

7. **DATE OF NEXT MEETING**

The next regular scheduled meeting will be held on January 11, 2012 at 5:30 o'clock p.m. in Room 402, 400 City Hall Square East.

8. **ADJOURNMENT**

**THE CORPORATION OF THE CITY OF WINDSOR
Planning Department**

MISSION STATEMENT:

"The City of Windsor, with the involvement of its citizens, will deliver effective and responsive municipal services, and will mobilize innovative community partnerships"

LiveLink REPORT #:	Report Date: November 3, 2011
Author's Name: John R. Calhoun	Date to WHC: November 9, 2011
Author's Phone: 519 255-6543 x 6179	Classification #:
Author's Email: jcalhoun@city.windsor.on.ca	

To: Windsor Heritage Committee

**Subject: Request to Modify Heritage-Designated Property: Add Solar Panels, Lower Chimney, and Add Skylights
Perry-Breault House, 245 Mill Street**

PD#
City Wide: Ward(s): 2

1. RECOMMENDATION:

That the Committee recommend to the City Council that the proposed modification of the property at 245 Mill Street (Plan 40 Part Lot 5), identified as the Perry-Breault House, **BE APPROVED** as submitted, under provisions of the Ontario Heritage Act, Part IV.

2. BACKGROUND:

In early summer 2011, Mr. Yingtao Shi, the property owner, enquired of the Heritage Planner about approval to add solar panels and modify the chimney. Subsequent consultation has resulted in the most recent version of the proposal, dated October 16, 2011.

The property was heritage-designated with By-Law No. 335-1999 on November 8, 1999, under provisions of the Ontario Heritage Act. The "Reasons for Designation" are attached.

3. DISCUSSION:

Property Description:

The location of this property is on the south side of Mill Street, between Sandwich Street and Russell Street. The back side of the Duff-Baby Mansion is immediately to the west; in 1895 the owners of what we now call the Duff-Baby house built a new house (the subject property) and

gave it to one of their children. Very close to the east is another single-family home; other surrounding buildings are a wide mix of residential and commercial forms.

The house is one-and-one-half-storey, L-shaped, with ends of the L terminating in gables facing the street and to the west. The designation identifies the style as "Vernacular Queen Anne Cottage". The front gable retains the original gingerbread; the side gable is plain. The roof has gabled dormers facing in three directions, and is covered with asphalt composition. Two chimneys remain; they are on the east wall and on the back side. The back porch extension has a hipped roof; it appears to be non-original. The detached, rectangular rear garage was built about 1920.

Proposal:

The request is to make three changes to the property:

(1) Solar panels are to be added to the rear roof, facing south southwest (see photo to right). These are photo-voltaic cells, in three rows with anchors separating the panels slightly from the roof surface. They will be positioned to within about 30 cm (1 ft) from the west edge and 45 cm (1.5 ft) from the ridge and bottom edge. An additional row will extend down to the back porch roof. The panels will not be visible from Mill Street.

(2) The rear chimney (see photo to right) will be lowered in height to about 1 m (3.3 ft) from the bottom edge of the roof and will be taken out of service. The current chimney has height added with new brick; the proposal would remove all the new brick and over half the old brick. The intent is to reduce the shadows on the solar panels. The original corbelling was gone before the designation in 1999.

(3) Three skylights will be added. One is to be added to the south side behind the shortened chimney; two are to go on the east side between the other chimney and a dormer. None of the skylights will be visible from Mill Street.

Legal provisions:

The designation by-law includes historical and architectural attributes (attached). In accordance with the Ontario Heritage Act, changes to designated property that affect listed features must be considered for approval by Council, after consulting with the Heritage Committee.

The proposed changes appear to have little effect upon the specified designated features. They would be seen as not part of overall Queen Anne style mentioned in the designation.

The Green Energy Act provides for some exemptions from the Ontario Heritage Act. However, the municipalities are still involved in decisions about alterations to heritage-designated properties. Overall, green-energy devices cannot be totally prohibited from heritage properties, but the municipality can direct some location of the equipment.

Architectural Considerations:

The proposed changes will be minimally visible from the front of the house.

The solar panels will clearly appear to be an addition, but the original shape of the roof will be clearly discernable. If desired in the future, the panels can be removed and the current state restored; thus the construction is considered **"reversible"**.

Other Considerations:

The proposed changes will be visible from the adjacent Duff-Baby Mansion, one of Windsor's most notable heritage buildings, constructed in 1798 and used in the War of 1812. The rear roof of the Perry-Breault House is visible from the large front lawn of the Duff-Baby Mansion (photo at left); however, it is discerned as belonging to another property.

Official Plan Policy:

The Windsor Official Plan includes Objectives "To conserve Windsor's heritage resources for the benefit of the community and posterity in a manner which respects their architectural, historical and contextual significance and ensures their future viability as functional components of Windsor's urban environment." (9.2.1)

The Plan states "Council will recognize Windsor's heritage resources by designating individual buildings ... as heritage properties under the Ontario Heritage Act." (9.3.3.1.a)

The Plan includes protection (9.3.4.1.). "Council will protect heritage resources by: (c) requiring that, prior to approval of any alteration, partial demolition, removal or change in use of a designated heritage property, the applicant demonstrate that the proposal will not adversely impact the heritage significance of the property ..."

4 . FINANCIAL MATTERS:

There is no identified financial impact to the City.

5. CONSULTATIONS:

The heritage planner and the owner have had ongoing consultations about the design. Legal Counsel have provided information about the Green Energy Act.

6. CONCLUSION:

The proposal to modify the Perry-Breault House at 245 Mill Street, by adding solar panels, lowering a chimney, and adding skylights should be approved as submitted as a permitted modification to the property designated under provisions of Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.

John R. Calhoun, AICP
Heritage Planner

Thom Hunt, MCIP, RPP
City Planner

NOTIFICATION:				
Name	Address	Email	Teleohone	Fax
Mr. Yingtao Shi	245 Mill St Windsor ON N9C 2R1	ytshi@yahoo.com	519-800-0340	
Ms. Evelyn G. McLean Les Amis Duff-Baby	POBox7424 Windsor ON N9C 4G1		519-945-2914	

Perry-Breault House, 245 Mill St

Reasons for Designation in By-Law No. 335-1999, passed by Council on November 8, 1999:

Historical

- Built in 1895 by the J.D. Perry family, the owners of the adjacent Duff-Baby house
- Occupied by prominent Sandwich families including the family of Eugene Breault. Eugene Breault (1869-1942) served as Mayor, Reeve, Councillor, Justice of the Peace, Water Commissioner and Police Magistrate for the Town of Sandwich, as well as school trustee for the Separate School Board.
- Long-standing Sandwich landmark that contributes positively to the aesthetic value of the streetscape.

Architectural

- Vernacular Queen Anne Cottage style
- L-shaped with gable ends
- original wood spindle porch altered to cement block columned verandah on east front (1907)
- original gingerbread on front gable intact
- projecting bay at northeast corner with ornamental cornice
- entrance set off to north side of front facade
- double hung windows retain their original form, 2 over 2 on the north wing, 6 & 8 over 2 on the front gable with shutters
- originally had cedar shingle roof, 3 corbelled chimneys, fish-scaled shingles on gable ends
- later rooftop dormers (c1921) emulate original roof style and slope and window design

Application to Install Roof Solar PV &
corresponding minor changes to

**Heritage Property on 245 Mill Street, Windsor
(Perry-Breault House, 1895, Queen Anne Cottage, Sandwich)**

16-10-2011, 27-09-2011

Dear Council Members,

To well preserve and make good use of the property, as well as, to make the old beauty a functional contemporary residence to prolong its life expectancy for a longer period, or possibly, another 100 years or more, I plan to invest big strength to repair and equip the heritage property.

As one of these efforts, I'll need to make some minor alternations to the outside though I will pay special attention to preserve its historical identities.

The proposed Roof Solar PV (Photovoltaic) project is as following.

1. To install 42-43 solar panels over the back yard (south-west) side of roof (5 of them over the back porch). They will not be visible from the front street even the driveway (Pic 1, 2). They will only be visible from the backyard or far west of the back side on Russell Street (Pic 3, 4). The roofing material will be visible on 4 sides of the rims of the roof (Fig 1, main design plan)
2. Current backyard-side chimney (not original) will need to be lowered. As Mr Calhoun suggested, the 1 meter higher over the roof surface is adopted in the plan (Fig 1, Pic 4, pot put is over the 1m height). Though there will still be some shading effect to make the adjacent panels ineffective for a period of time everyday, it will take account of aesthetic and limited shading effect.

Shading effect - as the nature of the PV panel design, the 1-e are 3 separate arrays in each panel. If any cell in an array is shaded, the whole array will not produce any electricity due to shaded cell's high resistance.

3. Three Skylight windows are planned. One operable (opening) at the back of the above mentioned chimney (Fig 1) to provide easy access to the roof to wash and clean the PV panels when needed; 2 fixed at the south-east wing between the domer window and the chimney (Photo 2) to provide natural lighting to the two new bathrooms on 2nd floor. They will be totally invisible from any where at the ground level.

For your reference, in the **Architectural** of the heritage document, what is related to this application is *"originally had cedar shingle roof, 3 corbelled chimneys, fish-scaled shingles on gable ends"*.

Appendix:

Fig.1 Layout plan of the S-W side and attached porch roof

Fig.2 Porch roof supporting plan A and B

Fig.3 (Pie 1-4) Sat map with photos to help explain the project

Applicant

Ymgtao
245 Mill St,
Tel: 519
email: ytshi@yahoo.com